



REGENERATION AND ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE – 4TH JULY 2017

**SUBJECT: YEAR END PERFORMANCE REPORT FOR ENGINEERING,
COMMUNITY AND LEISURE AND REGENERATION AND PLANNING**

REPORT BY: CORPORATE DIRECTOR COMMUNITIES

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 To provide members with a performance update of the Communities Directorate, firstly through taking a look back over the last twelve months of our performance against objectives highlighting the exceptions and then through looking forward, setting out our key objectives/priorities for the next twelve months, including any risks that may hinder performance.

2. SUMMARY

- 2.1 Overall 2016/17 offered a generally positive year in terms of service performance. However, a number of future challenges have been identified and action plans have been developed and captured in 17/18 service plans. The biggest challenge across the service area remains, how to balance the demands of increasing legislation and rising public expectations against reducing budgets. Whilst challenging, the service area is well placed to respond to them, but it must be recognised that reductions to some current service delivery standards over the next few years will be inevitable.

3. LINKS TO STRATEGY

- 3.1 The Single Integrated Plan 2013-2017 has a priority to 1) improve local environment quality 2) reduce the causes of and adapt to the effects of climate change and 3) maximise the use of the environment for the health benefits.
- 3.2 The Well being of Future Generations Act 2014 has 7 national Well-being goals which all public bodies are expected to maximise their contribution towards. The performance of these services and their objectives contribute to all 7 Welsh Government National Well-being goals

4. THE REPORT

- 4.1 The performance reported within this report for the Directorate of Communities does not include the Housing Service and WHQS as these will be reviewed under Policy and Resources Scrutiny, with the next update due on the 18th July 17. In addition a future meeting of Policy and Resources Scrutiny is expected to consider a detailed report on Communities First Project Delivery in 2016/17.

- 4.2 Each service area has carried out a self-evaluation of its services which flows into a service plan for the year ahead. The service plan details the priorities for the year ahead and these are summarised in the detail of the report.
- 4.3 This report provides an overall summary of performance from Engineering, Community and Leisure and Regeneration and Planning. The report provides an overview of the year highlighting exceptions of good performance as well as identifying any areas for improvement. The report also details the key objectives of the year ahead.

4.4 **Engineering**

The Engineering Services provides services that directly address Highways and Transportation needs throughout the county borough. Engineering consists of three core service groups, Highway Operations Group (HOG), Engineering Projects Group (EPG) and Transportation Engineering Group (TEG). The Service currently employs in the region of 255 personnel with annual budgets of £20.8 million revenue and £2.6 million capital.

4.4.1 Last year's performance

Overall, for a wide ranging front line service delivery area, the divisional performance of Engineering Services is judged to be good, producing variable results in view of key objectives set out for 2016/17.

By way of examples, positive results for 2016/17 include;

- Engineering Project Group (EPG) has again demonstrated value for money in terms of being cheaper than private sector consultants and the service is judged as being in the upper quartile for cost performance across Wales. This is evidenced by a range of national PIs collated by County Surveyors Society Wales (CSSW) that cover professional fee cost as a percentage of scheme cost over 3 cost ranges. In terms of performance, the service area is positioned in the upper quartile for cost performance across Wales and has consistently delivered projects below the all Wales average for the respective cost ranges. The all Wales average (public sector) is proven to be less than the private sector, thus demonstrating EPG's comparable VFM against the private sector. The data set used for this comparison is based on 23 projects procured through a tender process and delivered within the clients agreed project parameters of cost and time.
- EPG has successfully recruited three junior members of staff and have recently appointed two members of staff at an intermediary level together with one instance of promotion; this has gone a long way towards restoring the age demographic within the group and shows that succession planning, in terms of promotion from within, is actively taking place. Management of resources has improved, with effective programming and resource allocation reviewed regularly to ensure the efficient use of staff to meet the service provision demands.
- Third party insurance claims across all Highway Operations Group (HOG) services are down, with a consequential reduction in annual premiums being realised – a 20% reduction in claims from 170 number to 136 resulting in further reductions to annual premiums. The APSE survey, (which assesses Caerphilly's figures with approximately 15 peer councils) provides a comparison across Wales and this has identified Caerphilly as being in fourth position which is in the upper quartile for percentage change in number of non-repudiated third party claims
- The HOG have also demonstrated a robust response to dangerous incidents, reporting 100% completion of repairs within 24 hours, along with a notable improvement to the completion of safety inspections within programmed timescales, 97% compared with 90% for the previous year.

- For the Transportation Engineering Group (TEG) the Statutory Existing Route Maps submitted to Welsh Government (WG) under the Active Travel Act were well received by WG and one of only five Local Authority submissions to be approved.
- TEG also continues to maintain a low level of personal injury collision statistics for the county borough and is making good progress towards the Welsh Government road safety targets for 2020. Relevant figures are detailed below: -
 1. In the last 5 years Child casualties reached a peak in 2014 before falling 44% in 2015. (Number of child casualties: 2011 – 30; 2012 -31; 2013 -26; 2014 – 50; 2015 – 28)
 2. Elderly casualties followed a downward trend from 2012 to 2014 before rising 45% in 2015 with majority classed as drivers. (Number of elderly casualties: 2012 – 29; 2013 – 15; 2014 – 11; 2015 – 16)
 3. Pedestrian casualties fluctuated reaching a peak in 2014. (Number of pedestrian casualties: 2013 – 37; 2014 – 48; 2015 – 30)
 4. KSI casualties – a rise between 2014 and 2015, but over 40% below the baseline. (Number of KSI casualties: 2014 – 30; 2015 – 41. Baseline figure is 69. WG 2020 target is 41)
 5. KSI Motorcyclist casualties – a rise from 3 casualties in 2014 to 9 in 2015 reaching the baseline. (Baseline figure is 9. WG 2020 target is 7)
 6. KSI Young Persons casualties – a slight increase on 2014 but still 50% below the baseline. (Number of young person KSI casualties: 2014 – 8; 2015 – 12. Baseline figure is 24. WG 2020 target is 14)
 7. A gradually decreasing trend in collision numbers between 2013 and 2015 with a total drop of 12%. (Number of collisions: 2013 – 224; 2014 – 208; 2015 – 197)
- TEG has recorded the lowest average subsidy per passenger for tendered services at 68p.
- TEG has recorded the highest satisfaction for the provision of local bus service information, bus stop satisfaction and overall satisfaction in the local bus network: 63%, 79% and 66% respectively.

Areas that require strengthening include:

Whilst there has been minor improvement noted in terms of the treatment of highway surface defects, there is a recognition that the Service has been underperforming in this performance area; this has been mainly attributed to data capture / reporting issues created via the migration of Engineering Service's Data Management System (DMS), from EXOR to MAYRISE. In view of this, several control measures have been introduced that will be further monitored throughout 2017-18 to measure effectiveness. Current performance for repair of minor defects within 28 days is only currently achieving 46% compliance against a target of 80%.

Although improved performance levels have been observed for Engineering Services' Service Request response rates, the performance area has been further scrutinised and is aiming to achieve the required 100% target scoring. Further steps have been taken to improve the consistency of approach and closer monitoring has been implemented.

In relation to the performance issues highlighted above, the key performance indicators to be monitored, which will form part of the presentation at scrutiny committee whereby further information will be provided for discussion, are as follows;

- Average time taken to rectify highway surface defects (No. of days) - Target 28 days.
- Percentage of non-cat 1 (non-emergency) repairs completed in 28 days - Target 80%.
- Request response rates to Standard Service Requests within 20 working days - Target 100%.
- Request response rates to Members within 10 working days - Target 100%.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
% of non-cat 1 (non-emergency) repairs completed within 28 days	80%	46%	<p>There has been a slight improvement noted from last year's results (40%) owing to the implementation of weekend works and strengthening of the number of resources.</p> <p>However, the recording of accurate data and reporting capabilities were heavily compromised during the migration of Engineering Service's Data Management System (DMS), from EXOR to Mayrise. Although Officers worked closely with Mayrise providers (Yotta) and held regular trouble-shooting sessions, in order to reinstate this vital reporting function, the data continued to be inaccurate and therefore misleading to Officers in terms of effectively co-ordinating and prioritising resources. Early discussions and utilisation in Q1 suggests reporting issues have been improved.</p>
Average time taken to rectify highway surface defeats that were identified for this period (No of days)	28 days	33 days	As above
% of dangerous incidents repaired within 24 hours - Highways	100%	100%	The 2016/17 result shows a marginal improvement on last year's performance (2015/16 - 99%) and demonstrates the service's continued commitment in responding to and addressing emergency situations.
% of programmed highway safety inspections done within timescale	90%	97%	The 2016/17 result shows an improving trend compared to 2015/16 (96%)
Engineering Service request response rates to members within 10 working days	100%	91%	<p>The 2016/17 result shows an improving trend compared to 2015/16 (84%) and follows continued scrutiny of this performance area.</p> <p>The division is looking towards further improvement and performance is being scrutinised at regular intervals by Group Managers and further reviewed at Divisional Management Team (DMT) meetings.</p>
Engineering Services request response rate to Standard Service requests within 20 working days	100%	97%	<p>The 2016/17 result shows a much improved trend compared to 2015/16 (89%) and follows continued scrutiny of this performance area.</p> <p>The division is looking towards further improvement and performance is being scrutinised at regular intervals by Group Managers and further reviewed at DMT meetings.</p>

The average number of calendar days taken to repair street lamp failures during the year (Yearly)	4 days	3.94 days	The 2016/17 result shows 3200 faults rectified with an improving trend compared to 2015/16 (4.53%). The improvement reflects the focus on performance drawn into the new Street Lighting Framework, whereby service delivery is closely measured and reviewed..
THS012a The percentage of Principal (A) roads that were in overall poor condition (Yearly)	4.5%	4.3%	The 2016/17 result shows a marginally improving trend compared to 2015/16 (4.5%). The average in Wales for 2015/16 was 3.7% although the 2016/17 figure has not yet been reported. This indicates that Caerphilly's A roads are in a slightly worse condition than the average for Wales.
THS012b The percentage of Non-principal/ classified (B) roads that are in overall poor condition (Yearly)	6%	3.7%	The 2016/17 result shows an improving trend compared to 2015/16 (4.1%). The average in Wales for 2015/16 was 4.3% although the 2016/17 figure has not yet been reported. This indicates that Caerphilly's B roads are generally in a better condition than the All Wales average.
THS012c The percentage of Non-principal/ classified (C) roads that are in overall poor condition (Yearly)	13%	8.7%	The 2016/17 result shows an improving trend compared to 2015/16 (9.2%). The average in Wales for 2015/16 was 15.9% although the 2016/17 figure has not yet been reported. This indicates that Caerphilly's C roads are in a good condition compared to the rest of Wales.
RdS013 Number of casualties per 100,000 vehicle kilometres of local roads reported during the year (Yearly)	N/A	N/A	Annual PI – Data not available at this time. Based on the information provided, between 2014/15 to 2015/16 there has been a downward (improved) trend in the number of casualties reported - 2014/15 (26.11), 2015/16 (23.08). Based on the following number of casualties: 2014 – 291, 2015 – 259.
RdS016 Number of child casualties whilst walking or cycling per 10,000 population (5-15 yrs) (Yearly)	N/A	N/A	Annual PI – Data not available at this time. Based on the information provided, between 2014/15 to 2015/16 there has been a downward (improved) trend in the number of casualties reported – 2014/15 (14.11), 2015/16 (5.98). Based on the following number of child casualties while walking and cycling: 2014 – 33, 2015 – 14.

4.4.2 The key objectives for Engineering Services for **2017/18** include;

- Implementation of MTFP savings
- Restructuring of Division to maximise skills, service delivery and outputs.
- Maximising opportunities through the City Deal and Metro proposals, to improve connectivity across the county borough.

- Consolidation of existing customer/client base; align service provision to match client needs.
- Broadening/diversifying funding streams and identifying wider opportunities through effective marketing to attract new clients.
- Expand on collaborative working with neighbouring authorities and seek external opportunities within the wider market.
- Progress and deliver the Local Travel Plan (LTP).
- Manage the impact of the withdrawn replacement Local Development Plan (LDP).
- Fulfil the requirements of the Active Travel Act for Integrated Network Maps.
- Review Highway and Structures management to consider alignment with current Codes of Practice.
- Improve performance and maintain customer satisfaction levels.
- Review of key traffic management strategies, including, undertaking a countywide review of the Council's Highway owned off street car parks, Officer review of speed limits on A & B roads and consideration of undertaking Civil Parking Enforcement (CPE) given the Police will no longer provide this services from April 2018.

The delivery of the above objectives will be monitored by use of the following;

- Agenda items within regular Management meetings.
- Resource meetings held fortnightly.
- Senior engineering management interface to monitor progress and spend.
- Delivery officers' management meetings used to manage high level workload.
- Director/Cabinet member/Head of Service to engage with Welsh Government, other councils and other related bodies/groups such as Transport for Wales.
- Regular review of PIs within Ffynnon and by providing full assistance to Task and Finish groups

Risks that could hinder or prevent progress or achievement include;

- The senior leadership capacity across the division is of concern and measures are being put in place to address this.
- No budget increases will limit the Service's ability to improve the condition of highway assets.
- Reduction in staffing levels and inability to recruit new staff.
- Maximum value for money not achieved due to reactive planning and programming.
- Increasing public aspirations of the service.

4.5 **Community and Leisure**

The Community & Leisure Services Division delivers a broad range of services. Most of these services and their functions are 'front-line' due to their visible presence and high impact on the community neighbourhoods, towns and villages that they serve throughout the Caerphilly borough. The division has 1215 staff and an annual revenue budget of £26.21m.

Our vision statement is *"Improve the quality of life in our communities, by making communities more sustainable, improving civic pride, confidence and striving for excellence and continuous improvement in community health and well-being"*.

4.5.1 Last year's performance

Waste Collection Services continue to deliver high levels of performance and is likely to exceed the Welsh Government statutory targets for recycling (58%) for 2016/17 (projected outturn approximately 65% - subject to external verification). However, the service continues to be faced with challenges relating to a high amount of contamination in dry recycling waste which will be targeted over the summer period with an additional door stepping campaign. Challenges associated with increasing the participation of food waste recycling are also being

faced although as a result of a successful campaign last summer there has been an increase in participation to 47% (which is comparable to other Local Authorities). Results of the household survey shows that satisfaction levels have been maintained at a high level although there has been a very slight dip in satisfaction across the board.

The Waste Management & Street Cleansing service had an original net budget of £11.840million for 2016/2017 reduced from £12.296 million in 2015/2016 and this included budget reductions of £737k in support of the Council's MTFP. During the year an additional £800k budget was provided by the Council to help finance costs associated with dry recycling treatment, the revised 2016/2017 budget being £12.582million. Despite the inclusion of £800k additional budget, the service outturn for 2016/2017 will report an over spend of £207,610 primarily due to the significant additional costs incurred in relation to dry recycling treatment and also increased costs in relation to residual waste treatment and Civic Amenity site operations.

Future challenges include planned population increases, which will ultimately result in increased pressures on the service with more collections. Further MTFP savings are likely to be required and re-organisation of the current service. A review is currently being undertaken with the Business Improvement Portfolio Board considering all aspects of the waste service which followed a positive report from the Wales Audit Office. The service is concluding its modelling work with Welsh Government to ensure that it is equipped to meet future statutory recycling targets of 64% and 70% respectively. It is estimated that a report on the outcomes will be reported to members in the autumn of 2017.

The **Cleansing Services** workforce has downsized in order to deliver MTFP savings but cleansing standards have been maintained and customer satisfaction levels have improved. It is projected that performance levels will be maintained. The future challenge is to maintain existing service levels to meet customer expectations while delivering MTFP savings.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
The percentage of municipal waste collected by local authorities and prepared for reuse and/or recycled, including source segregated biowastes that are composted or treated biologically in another way	58%	65.65%	The figure entered as cumulative and is taken from WDF (Q1, 66.21%, Q2, 67.49%, Q3, 64.04% and Q4, 64.52). A change in legislation regarding the composting of wood has reduced the percentage recycled although the service is still achieving well above the target. Figure has not been audited by WDF team and is subject to change.
% of people participating in food waste recycling	44.10%	47.10%	2016/17 data captured between Dec 2016 and May 2017. The increase is due to a successful door stepping campaign.
The cost of Refuse Collection Services per household	£19	N/A	Year end data is unavailable at this time.
Domestic Refuse Customer Satisfaction	90%	92.70%	Results from the Biennial Household Survey 2015/16.
Food/garden Waste Customer Satisfaction	85%	77.90%	As above. Changes in charging structure for replacement green waste bags may have had a negative impact on customer satisfaction results.

Recycling Customer Satisfaction	85%	91.40%	Results from the Biennial Household Survey 2015/16.
Street Cleansing Customer Satisfaction	70%	77.30%	As above.
The percentage of highways and relevant land inspected of a high or acceptable standard of cleanliness	97%	96.93%	Whilst there has been a small increase on last year (95%) it will become more difficult to rise above the current levels with decreasing resources.
Street Scene Cleanliness Index LEAMS score for the whole of CCBC	69%	67.75%	LEAMS (Local Environment Audit and Management System) is a methodology used by the Authority and Keep Wales Tidy (surveying streets randomly selected from across the borough) to determine an overall cleanliness score for the County Borough.

The Sport and Leisure Service continues to see growth in the number of people participating in sport & leisure activities. There is an increase in direct debit memberships across the service with a 3.11 % increase on the same time last year. Sports Development has seen participation figures increase this year by 3% to 83,516 people. There has been an increased focus upon Learn to Swim programmes and performance has improved over the last 12 months. The number of free swim sessions for children aged 16 has improved against this time last year although the service is below the set target. An aquatic marketing plan is currently being developed with aim of increasing participation within all aspects of aquatic delivery. A focus area within the plan will be not only the provision of free swimming but reviewing the approach and delivery of aquatic programmes to under 16's more generally. The service will continue to benchmark across the sector, exploring examples of best practice along with creating pathways, both formal and informal within aquatic programme delivery. This year has seen a reduction due to younger children (aged under 11 years) participating in school swimming therefore not being included in the figures. WG has set all Local Authorities a target of 91% of all children aged 11 being able to swim 25 metres by the year 2020 and the Authority is working towards achieving this target.

Adults swimming, 60+ is above target on last year's performance. Customer satisfaction levels remain high with 97% of sport and leisure customers reporting they are satisfied with the service. Caerphilly is playing a leading role for delivering 'Active Gwent' a regional collaborative model for sport and physical activity and the development of a Sport and Leisure Strategy (awaiting final report) and a service review is planned with the development of the Business Improvement Portfolio Board.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Number of visits to indoor sport facilities (Leisure Centres)	1,428206	1,318027	Caerphilly LC major refurbishment works to the Health Suite (and its resultant closure period) has inevitably contributed to the out-turn in usage figures.
Number of Visitors to Sport Caerphilly Activities	84460	83516	Although the target wasn't quite met, the number of visits represents a good level of performance.

Number of people participating in the health referral scheme	1053	960	The NERS programme is externally funded and depends on referrals from Health professionals (GP's). The number of referrals is therefore not controlled by the Authority (and can also be influenced by complexity of individual cases). A new "fast track" referral system has recently been introduced across Wales which may assist in improving the number of referrals moving forward.
Number of free swim sessions - children aged 16 yrs and under	29092	27199	Slightly below target but over 3,700 more swimmers when compared to the same period last year.
Number of free swim sessions - adults aged 60 yrs and above	47755	50119	Continuing to perform above target with the provision of the over 60's free swim initiative in Caerphilly
Children age 11 yrs able to swim 25 meters	74%	54%	The 54% achieved this year is well under the national target and has decreased from last year. This year has seen a decrease in the number of schools taking up the SLA swimming offer along with younger age groups (not children age 11) and of testing age. The National target is 91% to be achieved by 2020. A number of interventions have been identified to address this issue, including the introduction of aquatic festivals which provide an additional testing environment whilst also encouraging aquatic participation in a less formal environment, additional targeted swimming lessons focusing upon smaller class sizes. There is also an integrated programme of swimming tutor CPD to enhance, develop and improve the tutor skill set. This will be supported by enhanced communication with those schools not currently participating in the swimming lesson programme.
% school years 3-6 participating in sport 3 times per week (Hooked on Sport)	44%	48.50%	Results from School Sport Survey 2015. The next School Sport; FE Survey will be run in the summer term of 2018.
% school years 7-11 participating in a sport 3 times per week (Hooked on Sport)	42%	46%	As above.
% pupils in school years 3-6 who report participation in a Sports Club	82%	83.40%	As above.
% pupils in school years 7-11 who report participation in a Sports Club	72%	75.70%	As above.

Sports & Leisure Service Customer Satisfaction	95%	97%	
--	-----	-----	--

Fleet Management & Maintenance service is subject to a significant level of scrutiny by auditors and regulators i.e. FTA (Freight Transport Association), DVSA (Driver and Vehicle Standards Agency), ISO accreditation. The service is facing internal and external challenges in respect of electronic defect reporting (connectivity problems), communication with the software provider has resulted in amendments to the system and this is currently being rolled out across all users. There has been an overall improvement in defect reporting returns. Maintaining workshop viability remains a challenge (due to a younger, hired fleet where there is no obligation for Caerphilly to undertake repairs and maintenance). Improvement works have been undertaken in the workshop with the installation of a new MOT ramp so that the service can undertake MOT's on Minibuses.

The Managed Service Partnership was awarded in February 2017 with a 3 month mobility period. Currently, 135 vehicles have been ordered and this is expected to increase to 350 by December 2017. The remaining vehicles will be replaced when they reach the end of their operational and economic life. Workshop productivity levels are low, and it is expected that it will remain this way until April 2018 at which time, vehicles provided by the Managed Service Partner will require statutory servicing and inspection. The number of vehicles maintained by the service will increase from 180 to almost 500, it is therefore anticipated that productivity will also increase.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Compliance with operator's licence - VOSA score against national operators	3	0	0 = green operator (lowest risk).
OCRS - Traffic Enforcement	3	3	This represents a good result which categorises the Authority as a "low risk" fleet operator when considered in conjunction with the above indicator.
Percentage of defect sheets returned reporting O licence vehicles only	100%	90.09%	2016/17 Target increased to 100%.
Vehicle Maintenance percentage productive hours	90%	64.24%	A decrease in the number of vehicles being maintained by workshops is having an impact on productivity. Implementation of the Managed Service Contract should contractually ensure that all vehicles will be maintained by CCBC Workshops. It is unlikely that this will improve until Financial Year 2018/19.

Building Cleaning Services continues its high levels of productivity and compares favourably when benchmarked with others via APSE. The service has an external ISO accreditation and undertakes internal audits to assess standards. There is evidence of good levels of customer satisfaction from APSE and local customer satisfaction. The future challenge is maintaining its customer base with customers looking to reduce costs through either reducing the amount/frequency of cleaning and/or building rationalisation.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Building Cleaning Turnover (£ x.xx M)	£3.19m	£3.22m	
APSE Building cleaning square metres cleaned per hour for Primary Schools	0.72	N/A	APSE data will be available Sept 2017.
APSE Building cleaning square metres cleaned per hour for Secondary Schools	0.88	N/A	As above.
APSE Building cleaning square metres cleaned per hour for all Offices	1.06	N/A	As above.
Quality Standards of Building Cleaning	95%	93%	Quality Standards– are a yearly audit on the cleaning sites which identifies the cleaner's compliance to our cleaning methods. This information is collated and the results are fed into the council's performance recording system and also highlights any training needs.
APSE Building cleaning customer satisfaction	80%		APSE data will be available Sept 2017.
Customer Satisfaction Local Survey random selections	95%	97%	Results are from 2016/17 biennial survey.
The number of customers (buildings) that are subject to a contract	220	231	

Parks & Bereavement Services grass cutting frequencies have been reduced from once every fortnight to once every three weeks to achieve MTFP savings, which has led to a slight drop in satisfaction levels. This may be attributable to the reduction in the grass cutting frequency and/or that conditions may have been more favorable for vegetation growth.

Three Parks are recognised as places of excellence by Green Flag assessors and awarded Green Flag status. During 2017, a further park (Ystrad Mynach) and one cemetery (Brithdir) were also assessed and we are currently awaiting the outcome.

Bereavement Services continue to recover its gross costs. The service has recently obtained planning permission to develop a brand new municipal cemetery in the Caerphilly basin and extend a number of other sites to ensure the Authority has sufficient burial space. The service continues to hold a Bronze award with Charter for the Bereaved.

Future challenges are the management of the Council's tree stock, in this regard a report will be considered by Regeneration & Environmental Scrutiny committee in October 2017. Other pressures include climate change, which has an effect on both the tree stock and sport pitches.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Number of Amenity Grass Cuts undertaken	9	9	4 grass cuts completed April - June 16. 5 grass cuts completed July - Sept 16.
Number of Parks that have achieved Green Flag National Status	3	3	Morgan Jones Park, Caerphilly, The Wern, Nelson and Waunfawr Park, Crosskeys.
Number of Trees Inspected (Yearly)	10,000	10,140	
Bereavements Income as a % of Gross Expenditure	100%	118%	Performance has dropped slightly since 2015/16 as the number of interments undertaken has declined. (797 interments during 2015/16 and 701 during 2016/17).
Charter for the Bereaved (annual) Best Value Assessment Score	3	3	This year's best value review has identified that even though the Authority retained a 'bronze' award, we are now only eight points from achieving 'silver' status. Number of points 2015 = 518 Number of points 2016 = 523 Number of points needed for 'silver' status = 531.
Grass Cutting and Weed Control Customer Satisfaction	75%	63.30%	Results of the 2015 Household Survey. There has been a drop in satisfaction levels (from 70% to 63%) this year and this may be attributable to the reduction in the grass cutting frequency and/or that conditions may have been more favourable for vegetation growth this year
Parks Services Customer Satisfaction	70%	67%	Results of the 2015 Biennial Household Survey. 67% of the public were satisfied with the condition of their local park/play area. Coincidentally, this mirrors the satisfaction level in 2013.

4.5.2 The key objectives for Community and Leisure Services for **2017/18** include;

- To deliver an effective and responsive Building Cleaning Service, Window Cleaning Service and Portable Appliance Testing (PAT) according to the needs of a range of building owners and occupiers
- To manage servicing and repair functions for the Council fleet of vehicles and to ensure legal operator and driver compliance, thereby retaining the Council's operating licence.
- To maintain public parks, sports fields, highway locations, allotments, housing estates and other public land, ensuring that they are safe, clean and fit for purpose
- To provide cemeteries that are well maintained with suitable burial provision
- To ensure the Council's tree stock is maintained to a safe and healthy condition
- To help get more people, more active, more often

- To deliver appropriate collection, treatment and disposal of waste & recyclables to both the domestic and commercial sectors whilst achieving Statutory Recycling Targets
- To keep the streets and public highways as clean and free from litter and graffiti as far as is reasonably practical.

4.5.3 The Community & Leisure Services self-evaluation process has identified a number of key challenges moving forward. These include:-

- The future shape of the Waste Management Service (Collection systems & Household Waste Recycling Site infrastructure) and the resultant level of budget provision.
- Adoption of a holistic Sport & Leisure Strategy for the Authority and the resultant review/rationalisation of the Leisure Facilities (Leisure Centres & artificial turf pitches).

Continuing to deliver crucial front-line services in accordance with the Authority's Medium Term Financial Plan resulting from reducing public sector finances.

4.6 **Regeneration and Planning**

The service area continues to respond to a number of changes taking place at a national, regional and local level. These include legislative changes which are in the process of being developed through the Planning Act and the Environment Act, as well as the Welsh Government White Paper on reforming local government and the evolving Cardiff Capital Region City Deal which are expected to result in a different way of working across a number of areas of the service. At a local level the departure of the Head of Service in March 2016 resulted in the introduction of ongoing interim arrangements, coupled with a general reduction in external grants, highlight the uncertain conditions that this service area continues to operate within.

The service consists of the Countryside and Landscape service, Development Management who deal with planning applications, and Strategic Development who are responsible for the Local Development Plan. The Business Support and Funding team provide advice and small grants to businesses and manage an extensive portfolio of industrial land, properties and business centres. Urban Renewal administers commercial property improvement grants and seeks external funding to develop and implement strategic regeneration projects. The Destination and Events team manage and market events such as the Big Cheese, the Caerphilly 10K Run and the Velothon and are responsible for five tourism venues, museum and heritage assets. In April 2017 the Community Regeneration Department was reassigned within the Directorate to the Housing Service in order to align with and prepare for the forthcoming significant changes in WG's approach to community regeneration. It is expected that the realignment of the Community Regeneration team will benefit overall service delivery and build upon the successes in employment outcomes achieved through recent complementary working between Community Regeneration and the WHQS officers in the delivery of the WHQS programme in the Upper Rhymney valley.

Moving into 2017/18 the Regeneration and Planning service has a staff establishment 161 that is supplemented by casual and relief staff who assist in the delivery of indoor and outdoor events throughout the year.

4.6.1 Last year's performance

Planning

Countryside: -

The team includes ecology, planning and landscape expertise, but its main public facing service is the countryside parks at Penallta, Cwm Darran, Bargoed, Pen-y-Fan, and Sirhowy. The 2016 survey indicates that 85% of those using the parks were very or fairly satisfied with the facilities. Whilst this percentage is slightly down from the previous survey it nevertheless

shows high levels of satisfaction. Parc Cwm Darran has retained its Green Flag status. Visits to country parks have increased by over 10% compared to the previous year and now exceed 1.2 million, meeting growth targets. A number of successful events have helped boost visitor numbers; however, growth has been achieved throughout the year. Whilst both the weather and economy influence use of the country parks the growth seemingly illustrates robust increases having risen from 1.1 million to over 1.3 million exceeding levels achieved prior to the introduction of charging in 2014, and that the impacts of the introduction of charging may be lessening. Income from car parking in 16/17 rose some 15% compared to 15/16 but remains nearly £30,000 below the target level of £85,000.

The Welsh Government target that 54% of Public Rights of Way should be readily useable has been exceeded at 80%, and there is a perception by other bodies e.g. Natural Resources Wales that the CCBC service is one of the best in Wales. However, the service does receive a large number of calls over the summer months and our ability to respond to them is limited by our staff resources. In order to manage this demand, it is acknowledged that the use of community groups and volunteers will be required. Some progress has been made in addressing the backlog of Definitive Map Modification Orders.

The Rural Development Programme team has bedded in and are providing a good source of additional funding, notably from the Sustainable Management Scheme and Rural Communities Development Fund. A range of projects totalling some £1million have received at least stage one approval from Welsh Government and this is in addition to the £2.6 million core funding already secured. The RDP has approved funding for 8 local projects and a further 13 are under consideration, and should these be approved would result in £850,000 of further project expenditure.

Development Management:-

After a dip in the overall performance of recent years, process changes introduced in the autumn of 2015 are already producing improvements, with the overall percentage of planning applications determined on time at 91% in the last quarter of 2016/17, which was above the Welsh average of 88%. The percentage of householder applications determined on time in the same quarter was 94%.

Welsh Government has recently changed the way it measures performance: the requirement to determine applications within 8 weeks has been replaced by the determination of application 'on time', i.e. within eight weeks or such longer period as is agreed with the applicant. To complement that change WG have also introduced another measure: the average time taken to determine planning application in days. That has been reduced by this local planning authority from 139 days in the last quarter of 2015 to 84 days in the first quarter of 2017, two days above the Welsh average.

Building Control:-

This service which monitors the construction of development is in direct competition with the private sector, but despite this it ensured a customer satisfaction rating of good or better of 86%.

Strategic Development:-

Following the annual monitoring report of the Local Development Plan (LDP) in 2013, a full review of the Plan was triggered. The review of the LDP was placed upon deposit in January 2016 with the deadline for the submission of comments by the public and others being 22 April 2016. Following that consultation Council in July resolved to withdraw the plan, subject to steps being taken to progress a Strategic Development Plan (SDP) with other authorities within the Cardiff Capital Region, and that the Minister and Welsh Government be approached respectively about grant funding to assist the development of brownfield sites, and to remove the current formula that forms the basis of the 5-year land supply calculation. Discussions are taking place at a City Region level about the production of an SDP, but the discussions about

grant funding and the land supply have not borne fruit. The annual Joint Housing Land Availability Study issued in August concluded that the 5-year land supply was 1.5 years. This has resulted in a number of planning applications for housing on land outside the allocations and settlements defined in the LDP. Where permission has been refused, consent has been granted on appeal. This approach has had a consequential impact upon the quantum of costs awarded to the Council

Regeneration

Business Support & Funding - The team's performance resulted in:-

- Increased overall occupancy levels of the Division's industrial units and office accommodation properties to over 98%. The property portfolio accommodates over 260 local businesses across 13 sites and generated over £2.2m of income
- The budget allocation for Business Development and Business Start-Up Grants supporting 55 grant offers during the year with 39 grant awards paid as the approved projects were concluded. The annual target for award of 80 Business Development Grant and Business Start-Up Grant was not achieved and for 2017-18 the target is to be revised downwards to acknowledge the reduced budget available for business grants due to the Local Investment Fund (LIF) ending in 2015-16.
- The business grant awards are estimated to create 83.4 new jobs and safeguard 290.8 jobs as the projects are implemented. However, the self evaluation process identified concerns around the methodology used to evaluate the number of safeguarded jobs and this particular KPI will not be continued into 2017-18.
- The responsibility for the Community Regeneration Fund (CRF) and Oakdale Community Benefit Fund was transferred to the Business Support & Funding Team from Policy Unit. The demand led CRF revenue budget was not fully allocated during 2016-17 with this under allocation being exacerbated by instances where applicants subsequently declining their in-principle CRF award as they were unable to secure the associated 20% match funding from their own resources or other sources.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Number of jobs created by Business Grant in the County Borough	50	83.4	Result for 2015-16 was 80.6 Target for 2017-18 increased to 60.0
Number of jobs safeguarded by Grant Schemes in the year	280	290.80	Result for 2015-16 was 334.4 The Self Evaluation identified concerns over the method used to determine safeguarded jobs and this KPI is to be discontinued The 2015-16 results included outputs from Local Investment Fund grants which were available until June 2015 Both 2016-17 results indicate a continued slow steady recovery from the recession

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Number of offers of financial assistance to local companies [CCBC business grant offers]	80	55	<p>Result for 2015-16 was 68 Target for 2017-18 to be revised to reflect reduced budget since Local Investment Fund ended June 2015</p> <p>Of the 55 offers 2 were subsequently withdrawn by agreement with applicant</p> <p>The 2015-16 results included outputs from Local Investment Fund grants which were available until June 2015</p>
%age occupancy level of Council owned commercial property portfolio	97%	98.1%	<p>Result for 2015-16 was 97.11% Target for 2017-18 increased to 98%</p> <p>At the end of 2016-17 there were only four industrial units and two offices unoccupied in the portfolio</p>

Areas within Business Support and Funding that have been identified as opportunities for improvement include obtaining formal feedback from property tenants via satisfaction surveys; the need to establish the current state of repair and condition of the property portfolio; confirming that industrial unit tenants are complying with the maintenance and repair requirements of their leases; monitoring the timescales for drawdown of the business grant awards; extending the geographic spread of the business grants and to continue to work with Caerphilly Business Forum (CBF) to increase business participation in the Forum and develop the wider mutual benefits that the CBF can bring to the local economy.

Community Regeneration:-

Following Welsh Government (WG) confirmation in February 2017 that the Communities First programme would be phased out the department is currently going through a period of significant transition.

Throughout the year, staff have coped admirably with the uncertainty surrounding the proposal to phase out Communities First; and despite this have continued to maintain a strong collaborative focus on tackling poverty, delivering to a high level, with excellent outcomes against a range of key indicators set by WG across many strategic priorities.

In-line with recent WG directives, Employability has been a strong focus of the work carried out during 2016-17 and will continue to be the focus of future work following the transition period.

Communities First:-

The most recent monitoring report by Welsh Government again identified Caerphilly as a high performing authority in Wales, most particularly in relation to the Prosperous and Healthier themes. Specifically, Caerphilly was:-

- The top performing authority in relation to Gaining Basic IT Skills
- 2nd highest authority in relation to Completing Employment Related Courses.
- 4th highest performing authority in relation to 16-25 year olds Entering Employment
- 6th highest performing authority for Adults (25+) Entering Employment.

- Within the top 4 authorities nationally for both Increased Physical Activity and Feeling More Positive about Mental Wellbeing.

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Number of people supported into employment (Through the Communities First Programme)	202	177	New KPI for 2016-17 Result breakdown:- 148 Communities First & 29 LIFT Target breakdown:- 157 Communities First & 45 LIFT

Final participation data for 2016/17 Quarter 4 is still outstanding; however as of the end of Quarter 3 (April to December 2016) 5835 people are recorded as having participated in Communities First activities. However, this figure includes customers accessing the Rhymney Valley Foodbank and drop-in/outreach services including Citizens' Advice and Streetgames and due to the high numbers that access these drop-in services, it is not possible to cross reference individuals' personal details with those participating in other CF projects so there is potential that the overall participation figure may include an element of double counting

Headline outcomes for Communities First programme over 2016-17	Target	Result
People entered employment	157	148
People gained an employment related qualification	266	286
People gained basic IT skills	320	473
People (adults) increased physical activity levels	675	842
Young people increased physical activity via Streetgames/Us Girls	552	1073
People feeling more positive about their mental health	260	242
People better able to manage their well being	226	247
Young people demonstrating improved academic performance (NB figures incomplete so likely to increase)	188	257
People (adults/parents) gained a qualification	131	110
Communities First customer satisfaction for the whole period 1 st Apr 2016-31 st March 2017 (based on customers rating the service as very good or excellent)	-	88.5%

Communities for Work:-

Within its first year of delivery in Caerphilly the 2016-17 Communities for Work (CfW) programme has already seen notable success in terms of outcomes, as a result of the intensive mentoring support that has been offered to customers by the team.

The Mid Valleys West cluster was the highest performing cluster across Wales. The commencement of the triage process has also been successful, in terms of creating an initial single point of contact for customers and partners; and ensuring that customers are referred to the service or officer which is most suited to their individual needs

Headline outcomes Communities for Work programme over 2016-17		
	Nr. Engaged / Supported	Nr. Entered Employment
Adults (25+) with complex barriers	111	19
Young People (16-24)	121	40

LIFT: - The 2016-17 LIFT programme within Caerphilly had its most successful year to date, continuing to build upon the progress of previous years with regards to employability support offered to workless households.

Headline outcomes for LIFT programme over 2016-17	Result
People engaged/supported	113
Participants completed training	46
Participants completed a work placement	22
Participants entered employment	29

As identified above, the Communities First programme is currently in the process of being phased out by WG. This will bring significant changes to the structure and direction of the Community Regeneration Department. Whilst the exact scale of these changes is currently unclear, it is known that the Department will continue its growing focus on Employability. The new Employability funding from Welsh Government will support an enhanced employment support team, encompassing the current LIFT team and working alongside the existing Communities for Work team, to create an overall holistic employability service. This service will work in close partnership with the other existing ESF employability projects to prevent duplication of service and ensure that unemployed customers across the County Borough will have access to support.

In addition, although not yet confirmed, the upcoming WG Legacy fund will also enable the Community Regeneration Department to focus on intensively supporting those areas within the County Borough which have been identified as being of highest need, based on a range of factors, most notably those relating to Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACEs), including domestic violence, substance misuse etc. Moving forward, this funding should enable a new approach to regeneration within these areas, whereby work will focus on co-ordinating multi-agency services through co-production and therefore maximising their levels of benefit for local communities.

Destination and Events:-

Key PI's	Previous Year 2016/17		Progress / Comments
	Target	Result	
Percentage annual increase in the number of people visiting the County Borough Calendar Year (STEAM)	3%	2%	Result for 2015 was 3.8% The pattern of visitors recorded to the county borough of Caerphilly has changed when compared to recent trends which has reduced the growth in economic value of visitors to the country borough where staying visitors have decreased in volume (-1.3%) and day visitors have continued their upward trajectory (+2.9%)

Over the last five years there has been a 19.5% increase in the overall number of visitors to the County Borough as a destination. Compared to recent trends the pattern of the 1.81million recorded visitors during 2016 has changed. Whilst day visitor numbers increased by 2.9% the number of staying visitors decreased by 1.3% and these factors combine to lessen the overall value of economic growth resulting from our visitors. From 2017 onwards the percentage annual increase in number of people visiting indicator is to be replaced with a Key PI that measures the percentage annual change in the total economic impact of tourism within the County Borough.

Tourism's total economic impact, at 2016 prices, is estimated to be have increased by 1% when compared to the previous year and in 2016 be worth around £121.75m to the County Borough's economy.

The team's performance resulted in:-

- Positive visitor and local retailer feedback from a number of successful events being held including the Big Cheese, Armed Forces Day, Christmas markets and through partnership working with other Divisions the Caerphilly 10K run and Velothon Wales. The Christmas pantomime at Blackwood Miners Institute attracted an audience of 15,377 significantly exceeding all previous ticket sales records.
- Llancaiach Fawr benefiting from Big Lottery funding to enhance exhibition space, receiving a Junior Design Gold Award, hosting the Bedwellty Show and being used as a film set as part of "Will" the biggest budget US television production ever to be shot in Wales.
- Blackwood Miners Institute benefiting from receiving additional support from the Arts Council of Wales which has boosted the programme and touring partnership activity.

In 2016-17 the number of visitors to Council-owned destination venues has varied as set out below:-

Venue	2015 - 16 Actual	2016 - 17 Actual	2016 - 17 Target	Comments
Blackwood Miners Institute	31,545	33,209	32,000	5% increase and above target
Caerphilly Visitor Centre	251,578	266,063	190,000	6% increase and target to be increased
Cwmcarn Forest Drive	216,887	213,461	220,000	2% decrease and target revision required due to ongoing tree felling work
Llancaiach Fawr	167,191	59,076	65,000	2015-16 comparison is inappropriate due to hosting URDD Eisteddfod but 2016-17 actual is 9% below target
New Tredegar Winding House	10,891	9,281	13,000	15% decrease and significantly below target. NTWH marketing and event officer resigned in year and this post remains to be filled whilst the staff cost is balanced against the income generation potential that the post could secure for the venue.

The 2016-17 attendance levels resulted in an overall increase in the level of trading income but there were again variations in actual income achieved across the individual venues. The additional income generated at Caerphilly Visitor Centre and Blackwood Miners Institute made a significant contribution to the overall increase in income across all venues.

Within Destination and Events the areas identified as opportunities for improvement include the need to identify and maximise income opportunities; to work closely with NRW at Cwmcarn Forest Drive to identify development opportunities and increase public awareness on accessibility during the continuing tree felling operations; to obtain post event feedback that informs a post-event review process and to secure additional funding to replace the sewerage disposal system at Llancaiach Fawr and to establish enhanced accommodation at Cwmcarn.

In order to sustain the Destinations and Events service over the medium to longer term, it is essential that we have in place delivery models that maximises income opportunities and reduces the subsidy provided by the Council. As such the "Alternative Ways of Working" for this service area that are under consideration as part of the Business Improvement Board work programme needs to be concluded at the earliest opportunity in order to clearly set out the means by which the Council intends to deliver the future aims and objectives of the Destinations and Events service

Urban Renewal:-

The team's performance resulted in:-

- The vibrancy of our town centres being enhanced through the delivery of the Commercial Improvement Grant programme which provides assistance to owners of retail or commercial properties to improve their building's appearance and presence.
- Positive activity on the high street as a number of new businesses established themselves in our town centres and the footfall in our three principal town centres increased overcoming the previous downward trend.
- The "Choose the High Street" initiative continuing in 2016-17 to promote opportunities to the retail/commercial sector to reduce premises vacancy levels and by focusing on the benefits of town centre shopping.
- Poundworld's anchor store at Lowry Plaza, Bargoed continuing to establish itself throughout 2016-17. Further to Unit 7 being occupied in February 2017 and Units 3 and 4 currently under offer only one unit remains to secure a tenant.

The data recorded within our main town centres is set out below:-

Town	Footfall	Footfall	Number of weeks footfall not measured (breakdowns)		Net new businesses	Net new businesses
	(2015-16)	(2016-17)	(2015-16)	(2016-17)	(2015-16)	(2016-17)
Bargoed	779,000	801,000	10	8	3	1
Blackwood	1,021,000	1,524,000	19	0	1	9
Caerphilly	1,438,000	1,460,000	2	0	5	6
Risca	456,000	419,000	6	6	2	4
Newbridge	359,000	282,000	17	15	-	-

Within Urban Renewal the areas that have been identified as opportunities for improvement include the need to replace footfall monitoring equipment to overcome frequent breakdowns; to reduce the timescales for processing approval and implementation of the projects supported by Commercial Improvement Grant projects and to improve compliance with EU grant funding regulations particularly when changes in the scope and extent of contracts are required during a project's implementation.

The future role of our town centres needs to be defined and again this should link with the evolving overall regional strategic approach. At a local level, it is intended to develop a masterplan for the Caerphilly basin, which will include a future vision for the town centre, that aligns with the Lansbury Park improvements and ambitions. The City Region priorities for the Metro integrated transport system provide an opportunity for our main towns to explore alternative uses for their town centre such as accommodating digital hubs, arts and creative industries incubators

4.6.2 Key objectives for 2017/2018 are:

- Review the service offer in the wider context of regional and legislative changes, with specific emphasis on:
- Active engagement in the development of the WG reform agenda and Cardiff Capital Region City Deal to establish regional and local priorities.
- Seek consensus for and commit to lead the development for the Cardiff Capital Region.
- Develop and obtain Council approval of a new regeneration / resilience strategy that aligns with the regionalisation agenda and the emphasis of increased external funding opportunities for those projects that deliver economic outputs.
- Agree a MTFP for 2018-19 to 2021-22 that takes account of local and regional priorities and realistic income generation proposals.
- Affect a seamless move of the Community Regeneration team into Housing Division
- Develop and obtain Council approval of a Caerphilly Basin masterplan that takes account of and aligns with the Lansbury Park "Coalition for Change" programme and actions identified in the Deep Place Study.
- Implement a restructure of the Regeneration and Planning Division that takes account of regional and local priorities and ongoing financial pressures.
- Compliance with the Council's Welsh Language Delivery Plan particularly at Destinations and Events venues.

Key Risks for 2017/2018 are:

- The pace of the strategic regional approach upon which to link our local priorities and identify areas of potentially conflicting priorities.
- Reduction in funding, particularly where projects are dependent on grants from other bodies.
- The availability of "at risk" development funding to prepare robust external funding bids.
- Balancing MTFP requirements against the delivery of identified priorities.
- The capacity and capability of community groups to allow delivery of certain objectives by alternate means.
- The uncertainty regarding the future of the Communities First programme.

5. WELL BEING OF FUTURE GENERATIONS IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 The sustainable development principles of involvement, collaboration, long term, integration and prevention (ICLIP) have not been specifically included in this report as the content is not seeking decisions but providing a picture and discussion of how the services performed in 16/17. However where possible the key objectives for the services have been set with the 5 principles in mind, for example in para 4.5.2 to get people to be more active more often is about preventing poor health over the longer term and this will require a collaborative and integrated approach to be delivered successfully.

6. EQUALITIES IMPLICATIONS

6.1 An Equalities Impact Assessment is not required as the report is for information.

7. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

7.1 There are no financial implications to this report although there may be some in respect of identified risks as part of performance.

8. PERSONNEL IMPLICATIONS

8.1 There are no personnel implications to this report

9. CONSULTATIONS

9.1 There are no consultation comments that have not been included in this report.

10. RECOMMENDATIONS

10.1 The Committee is asked to consider the content of the report and where appropriate question and challenge the performance presented.

11. REASONS FOR THE RECOMMENDATIONS

11.1 Performance Management Scrutiny affords members the opportunity to challenge, inform and shape the future performance of the services that are presenting their priorities for 2017/18.

12. STATUTORY POWER

12.1 Local Government Measure 2009.

Author: Christina HARRY, Corporate Director, Communities
Ros Roberts, Performance Manager, Corporate Performance Management
Marcus Lloyd, WHQs and Infrastructure strategy Manager
Mark.S. Williams, Head of Community and Leisure
Dave Whetter, Interim Head of Regeneration
Tim Stephens, Interim Head of Planning

Consultees: Cllr B Jones, Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Finance, Performance & Governance
Cllr S Morgan, Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Economy, Infrastructure, Sustainability and Well Being of Future Generations
Cllr E Stenner, Cabinet Environment and Public Protection
Cllr N George, Cabinet Member for Neighbourhood Services
C Burns, Interim Chief Executive
N Scammell, Acting Director of Corporate Services & S151 Officer
R Roberts, Performance Manager, Corporate Services
I Raymond, Performance Officer, Corporate Services